The fundamental role of education – in global bioethics

Henk ten Have, MD, PhD
Center for Healthcare Ethics
Duquesne University, Pittsburgh, USA
Outline

1. Why do we educate and what is good education?
2. What is the mission of bioethics education?
3. Two philosophies of bioethics education
4. Bioethics education and global bioethics
   - Global ethical framework
   - Global bioethics principles
   - Focus on global bioethics teaching
Why do we educate and what is good education?

St. Augustine (405):

What is the best approach to teaching?

Education is not successful if it is not passionate and inspired.

It should not merely be focused on knowledge or skills but it should motivate and inspire.

Teachers and learners are united in the same endeavor:

they want to be better persons
Why do we educate and what is good education?

The ultimate aim of education is transformative: to effect beneficial changes in humans.

Education is fundamentally a moral enterprise.

But at the same time it is conservative.

John Dewey: *A common faith* (1934):

> Education is the manifestation of humankind’s responsibility to conserve, transmit, rectify and expand the heritage of the values we have received.
What is the mission of bioethics education?

More restricted and focused than education in general:

**Professional education:**

What is valuable in being a professional and what is required for participating in a professional community?
What is the mission of bioethics education?

What do we hope to achieve?

**Knowledge**
- Information and facts
- Identification of moral issues
What is the mission of bioethics education?

What do we hope to achieve?

Skills

- Recognize ethical issues
- Analysis and reasoning
- Understanding and explaining
- Justification and argumentation
What do we hope to achieve?

**Attitudes**
- Sensitivity to ethical questions
- Professional virtues
- Good conduct

What is the mission of bioethics education?
What is the mission of bioethics education?

What do we hope to achieve?

a. **Knowledge**
   - Information and facts
   - Identification of moral issues

b. **Skills**
   - Recognize ethical issues
   - Analysis and reasoning
   - Understanding and explaining
   - Justification and argumentation

c. **Attitudes**
   - Sensitivity to ethical questions
   - Professional virtues
   - Good conduct

- enhancing medical decision-making
- producing better physicians
- enhancing quality of patient care
Two philosophies of bioethics education

- focus on facilitating clinical practice: teaching skills
- pragmatic: focus on what is practical and measurable

Promote better decisions

Gillon (1996): ethics teaching is not intended to improve the moral character of future doctors
Two philosophies of bioethics education

ambitious view

- focus on character formation, integrity and professional virtues
- ultimate aim is to make medicine more humane
- professionalism not only requires transmission of information but learning of values and attitudes

Make better health professionals
Two philosophies of bioethics education

- need for ethics teaching reiterated every time when professional behavior is problematic
  - NIH/NSF requirement for ethics education (2010)

  Ethics teaching as remedy against lack of virtuous behavior

- ethics is not an add-on but it is already there, intrinsic in medical culture

  Formal and explicit bioethics education should connect with the internal morality: ‘the hidden curriculum’
Bioethics education and global bioethics

- Global ethical framework
- Global bioethics principles
- Focus of global bioethics teaching
Global ethical framework

The ideals of cosmopolitanism
• unity of humanity: Human beings belong to the cosmos; world citizenship.
• the cosmos includes the whole of humanity; universal community.
• boundaries have no moral significance.
• openness to differences.
• focus on what human beings have in common.
• all human beings have equal moral status.
• global citizens have responsibilities and solidarity, not merely rights.
Global ethical framework

Common humanity
- Expanding the circle of moral concern
  - Augustine: monstrous births are human
  - Pope Urban VIII (1639): Indians are human
  - Pope Leo III (1888): condemnation of slavery

Common home
- Emphasis on commons and common good
  - 2009: Pope Benedict XVI: the book of nature is indivisible
  - 2015: Pope Francis: Laudato Si: common home
Global bioethics principles

UNESCO 2005: 15 principles for global bioethics

1. Human dignity and human rights
2. Benefit and harm
3. Autonomy and individual responsibility
4. Consent
5. Persons without the capacity to consent
6. Respect for human vulnerability and personal integrity
7. Privacy and confidentiality
8. Equality, justice and equity
9. Non-discrimination and non-stigmatization
10. Respect for cultural diversity and pluralism
11. Solidarity and cooperation
12. Social responsibility and health
13. Sharing of benefits
14. Protecting future generations
15. Protection of the environment, the biosphere and biodiversity
Global bioethics principles

- Human dignity and human rights
- Benefit and harm
- Autonomy and individual responsibility
- Human vulnerability and personal integrity
- Privacy and confidentiality
- Non-discrimination and non-stigmatization
- Cultural diversity, pluralism and universalism
- Solidarity and cooperation
- Social responsibility
- Sharing of benefits
- Future generations
- Protection of the environment and biodiversity
Bioethics is weighing and balancing of ethical principles

- Argumentation
- Justification

- Individual perspective
- Family/community perspective
- Social/cultural perspective
- World perspective
### Global bioethics principles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical principles</th>
<th>New concepts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Human dignity and human rights</td>
<td>Common heritage of humankind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human vulnerability and personal integrity</td>
<td>- Common good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural diversity, pluralism and universalism</td>
<td>- Benefit sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solidarity</td>
<td>- Future generations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social responsibility</td>
<td>Sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing of benefits</td>
<td>Intergenerational justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future generations</td>
<td>Diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection of the environment and biodiversity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Global bioethics principles

Ethical principles
- Human dignity and human rights
- Human vulnerability and personal integrity
- Cultural diversity, pluralism and universalism
- Solidarity
- Social responsibility
- Sharing of benefits
- Future generations
- Protection of the environment and biodiversity

New concepts
- Common heritage of humankind
  - Common good
  - Benefit sharing
  - Future generations
- Sustainability
- Intergenerational justice

Applications
- status of human genome
- patenting/property rights
- vulnerable groups
- pain and suffering
- food (obesity/ hunger)
- international clinical trials
- migration of health professionals
- human/ organ trafficking
- bioprospecting/ biopiracy
- refugees and migrants
- environmental degradation
Global bioethics principles; enlarging of ethical perspective

**Mainstream bioethics**

*Autonomous individual*

Rational decision-maker

Care and competency are individual affairs

Ownership of the body

Informed consent as transaction

No responsibility for social, economic and political conditions

**Global bioethics**

*Social ethics*

Individual person always embedded

Personal autonomy is produced in social conditions

Respect for human vulnerability

Positive notion of society; conditions make human flourishing possible

Focus on the common good

Need for collective action
Focus of global bioethics teaching

**Example:** UNESCO Bioethics Core Course
UNESCO Bioethics Core Course

- based on principles of Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights
- proposes a minimum program
- flexibility: does not impose a particular model
- global outreach: useful in all regions
- heterogeneity: variety and diversity around a common core

- aim: to facilitate the introduction of bioethics primarily in medical and science schools
Structure and Contents of Core Course in Bioethics

Contents: 17 modules

Structure:
- Section 1: Syllabus: Learning Objectives; Outline; Teacher Manual
- Section 2: Study materials: Cases, videos, literature, etc.

General Objectives:
Students should be able to
- identify ethical issues in medicine, health care and life sciences
- provide rational justification for ethical decisions
- apply the ethical principles of the *Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights*
UNESCO Bioethics Core Curriculum

For each unit

- Unit learning objectives
- Outline of the syllabus
- Teacher manual
UNIT 3: HUMAN DIGNITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Unit learning objectives
- Students should be able to explain and apply the concepts of human dignity and human rights
- Students should understand the relevance of these concepts in the context of bioethics

Outline of the Syllabus
1. Concepts of dignity in the history of ideas
2. Human dignity as an intrinsic value of the person capable of reflection, sensitivity, verbal communication, free choice, self-determination in conduct and creativity
3. The diverse understandings of human dignity in different cultural and moral traditions and different types of society
4. A person’s dignity and rights entail others’ obligation to treat a person respectfully
5. Ethical aspects of health care provider-patient relations in regard to human dignity and human rights
Thank you